

Journal Club Critique

1. Topic & Reviewer

1. Topic

2. Reviewer Name

3. Journal Club Date

2. Introduction

4. Is the study relevant & important to our practice?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

5. Is the work useful & original? Does it add to the fund of useful knowledge?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

6. Was the study setting similar enough to our working environment that, assuming the results are valid, they may be extrapolated to our practice?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

3. Methods

7. Was the architecture or design of the study appropriate to answer the questions posed in the introduction?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

8. Is the connection between the hypothesis & the instruments used clearly justified?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

9. Is the relationship between outcomes & measures plausible?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

10. Are the instruments used appropriate to the study & have they been validated previously?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

11. Are the population & the population sample defined & recognisably similar to that seen in practice?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

12. Are the recruitment definitions & inclusion/exclusion criteria clearly stated?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

13. Is the sample size sufficient to answer the questions posed, & has there been an attempt to estimate the required numbers in advance?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

4. Results

14. Is the response rate adequate? Are drop-outs well described, & is there any reason to think that they differ materially from responders?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

15. Are the tables & figures clear?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

16. Have statistical tests been applied appropriately?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

17. Are p values or confidence intervals used?

- Yes
- No

Other (please specify)

18. Where statistically significant differences are found, are they sufficient to be clinically important?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

5. Discussion

19. Does the discussion show an awareness of the methodological limitations of the study design? Are problems or difficulties acknowledged?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

20. Are the conclusions drawn justified by the results presented?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

21. Is a comparison drawn with other published work?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

22. Do the authors speculate too far beyond the evidence presented?

- Yes
- No

More detail:

6. Summary

23. Summary and overall comments:

